Sunnybrook Ethics Centre’s
2010 & 2011
Two Year Report

Sally Bean, JD, MA Ethicist & Policy Advisor
Blair Henry, MTh Ethicist
April 20, 2012
Outline

• Summary of 2009-2013 Ethics Centre’s Strategic Plan
  – Projects based on Strategic Foci
  – Current Projects and Strategic Alignment

• Activities Updates
  – Ethics Advisory Group (EAG)
  – Ethics Strategic Advisory Group (ESAG) Update
  – Academic Activities
  – Consultation Summary
  – Educational Events & Debriefs Summary

• Future Directions
Vision
The Ethics Centre (EC) is the leading provider of in-hospital ethics services in the GTA.

These services are a visible, influential, and integral part of organizational decisions and actions, and reflect organizational values.

These services enhance ethics capacity throughout the organization to determine what matters most in providing care when it matters most.
2009-2013 Strategic Plan
Overview

*Building on strengths, seizing opportunities*

1. Increase Ethics Centre (EC) visibility and awareness from bedside to boardroom

2. Develop integrated, sustainable and accountable program-based ethics capacity

3. Emphasize preventative ethics

4. Innovation in ethics programming and research
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Increase EC Visibility</th>
<th>Develop Ethics Capacity</th>
<th>Preventative Ethics</th>
<th>Innovative Programming</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Quality Dying Project (Member)</td>
<td>Ethics Advisory Groups (EAG), EAG Forum, Ethics Strategic Advisory Group* (ESAG)</td>
<td>Corporate Uninsured Policy (Lead)</td>
<td>EAG &amp; ESAG model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior Friendly &amp; CPR Committees (members)</td>
<td>Patient Declaration of Values/ Public Engagement (consultant)</td>
<td>Complementary and Alternative Medicine Policy (Lead)</td>
<td>Accountability for Reasonableness (A4R) application in HAPS &amp; Strategic Planning (consultant)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Grey Zone Blog (Lead)</td>
<td>Nursing &amp; resident orientation (Lead)</td>
<td>Hospital Interpretation Pilot &amp; Policy (Co-Lead)</td>
<td>Joint Centre for Bioethics Professionalization &amp; Documentation working group (member)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethics Consultation Education Events &amp; Debriefs</td>
<td>TECC/OCC-RRT Moral Distress (consultant)</td>
<td>Advance Care Planning (Lead for external scan)</td>
<td>Palliative Sedation working group (consultant)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bullet rounds with Risk Management and Patient Experience Office</td>
<td>Hot Spot Contributors</td>
<td></td>
<td>Development of revenue generating Ethics Support Service</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Ethics Centre Organizational Chart & Reporting Structures

Last updated: January 3, 2012

Senior Leadership Team (SLT)

Ethics Strategic Advisory Group
Senior Leaders, EC members & identified internal & external key stakeholders
Key activities:
- provide consultation to SLT on org ethics issues
- provide guidance to EC

Quality & Patient Safety

Ethics Centre (EC)
Sally Bean & Blair Henry, Ethicists
Dawn Bovingdon, Admin Asst.
Key Activities:
- Consultation
- Education
- Policy
- Research
- Ethics Advisory Group (EAG)
- Development & Management

University of Toronto Joint Centre for Bioethics (JCB)
-- Partnership

Ethics Forum
Assembly of EAGs reps:
key activities:
- Link Programs
- Plan strategy
- Identify and share best practice

Schulich Heart Program (BH)
-- Membership constituted
  -- TOR completed
  -- Survey completed
  -- Rounds in place

Trauma, Emergency & Critical Care (BH)
-- Membership constituted
  -- TOR completed
  -- Survey completed
  -- Rounds in place

Veterans & Community Program (BH)
-- Membership constituted
  -- TOR completed
  -- Survey completed
  -- Rounds in place

Odette Cancer Centre (SB)
-- Membership constituted
  -- TOR completed
  -- Survey completed
  -- Rounds in place

Women & Babies (SB)
-- Membership constituted
  -- TOR completed
  -- Survey completed
  -- Rounds in place

Holland Musculoskeletal (SB)
-- Membership constituted
  -- TOR completed
  -- Annual rounds in place
New & Innovative EAG Activities

• In 2011, creation of “Ask the Ethicist” forum for staff to anonymously ask questions to the EAG members and a written response is provided & distributed
  • Established in TECC & Women & Babies

• Academic articles with associated questions circulated monthly for Women & Babies staff

• Initiated “clinical chats” to provide ethics support to frontline staff in Schulich

• Monthly “Last Rites” rounds for CrCU staff to deal with moral distress related to challenging EOL cases

• Preliminary discussions with Odette EAG about conducting research on patient’s ethics needs

• “Handling the tough questions” workshop at the Veteran’s Centre
EAG’s by Program

• Odette Cancer Centre
  – Established monthly ethics rounds. Sample rounds topics include:
    • Consent & Capacity
    • Moral Distress
    • Recognizing Ethical Issues
    • Discharge Planning
    • Predicting outcomes when cancer patients become critically ill
    • Inter-professional conflict
    • Bio-banking
    • Assisted Suicide
EAG’s by Program

• Trauma Emergency and Critical Care
  – Ongoing monthly “Last Rites” rounds for CrCU staff to deal with moral distress related to challenging EOL cases
  – Creation of an “Ask the Ethicist” forum for staff to ask questions to the EAG members and a written response is provided
EAG’s by Program

• Veterans and Community
  – Staff Ethics survey
  – Rounds to present survey findings
  – Presentation to Program Council
  – Death and Dying talk as part of the Education Calendar
  – Consent and Capacity Educational Rounds
  – 2 Handling the tough questions workshop
EAG’s by Program

• Women and Babies
  – Conducted program ethics needs assessment survey
  – Established quarterly rounds
    • Fetal reductions
    • Care at the limits of viability
  – Incorporated Ask the Ethicist
  – Send out monthly articles & associated questions for reflection
EAG’s by Program

• Schulich Heart Centre
  – Held Medical Grand Rounds: “EOL Care for patients with heart failure.” (Spring 2011)
  – Initiated “clinical chats” to provide ethics support to frontline staff
EAG’s by Program

• Brain Sciences
  – Initiated a Medical Grand Rounds in 2011 by Dr Reznek
  – Awaiting meeting with Program Executive to plan out the staff survey and recruitment of EAG members
EAG’s by Program

• Holland Centre
  – Regular check-ins with EAG chair
  – Established Annual Rounds
  – Inaugural rounds on disclosure of adverse events
  – Presented to OPSIT committee
ESAG Update

• Convened 4 times in 2010 & 2011
• Issues discussed:
  – Hallway patients & HCP moral distress
  – Corporate uninsured policy
  – Hospital interpretation services
  – Revenue generation activities
  – Discharge Policy
  – Uninsured dialysis patient policy
2010 & 11 Academic Activities Summary

2011 Activities
- 8 publications (7 first-author publications)
- 12 The Grey Zone blog posts
- 15 external conference presentations or invited lectures
- Peer reviewer for 7 journals
- Blair’s Faculty Appointment in Dept. Family & Community Medicine
- Journal Editorial Board member

2010 Activities
- 13 publications (10 first-author publications)
- 15 external conference presentations or invited lectures
- Peer reviewer for 3 journals
- Journal Editorial Board member
EC Publications 2011


- Henry, B. Medical Error and Its Impact on Staff. Hot Spots August 2011 Vol 13, Issue 3, pg 2


2011 Grey Zone Blog Topics:

- **Henry B.** Should physician-assisted suicide be legal in Canada? Dec. 21, 2011
- **Bean S.** Should Patients Communicate with their Doctors through E-mail? Nov. 24, 2011
- **Henry B.** Advanced are planning, where belief rarely matches reality; Nov. 1, 2011
- **Bean S.** Should uninsured services be offered within public health care institutions? Oct. 6, 2011
- **Henry B.** Should health care costs be rationed? Implications on paper will mean tough decisions at the bedside; Sept. 26, 2011
- **Bean S.** Uninsured Patients Seeking Access to Care; Sept. 8, 2011
- **Bean S.** Bioethics at the Movies; Aug. 31, 2011
- **Henry B.** Should sedation be a treatment option to manage suffering for patients at the end of life? Aug. 25, 2011
- **Henry B.** Should patients with "unrealistic optimism" be allowed to enroll in early phase drug trials? July 27, 2011
- **Bean S.** Should healthcare professionals provide treatment to uninsured patients? July 14, 2011
- **Henry B.** Should hospital visiting hours be restricted or unrestricted? June 30, 2011
• Henry, B. Defining a good death: euthanasia and physician-assisted suicide redefined. Scrub-In 5 (1) January 2010
• Oneschuk, D, V. Cellarius, L. Librach, B. Henry, M. Dean “Re: Euthanasia hearings spark questions over Criminal Code, September 7, 2010” National Post Letter to the Editor, September 13, 2010. (CA)
• Callum, J., Henry, B. and Lin, Y. Transfusion for Protocol Eligibility. Letter to the Editor, NEJM 363;17 October 21, 2010 pg 1681-82. (CA)
• **Henry B.** January 25, 2011 “How moral distress can impact your practice” Inter-professional Practice Rounds, Providence Healthcare, Toronto, ON

• **Henry B.** et al Expert Panel Massive Transfusion Conference Toronto ON (June)

• **Henry B.** Conference Presentation- Palliative Sedation Therapy, Santiago Chile (August)

• **Henry B.** April 14, 2011 “Ethical Imagination and Awareness” Alzheimer Society of Canada Support staff rounds

• Shuchman M. **Bean S.** When & How REBs Get it Wrong. ICES Rounds, April 12, 2011.

• **Bean S.** REB Member Conflicts of Interest. University of Toronto, HIV Research Ethics Board. May 4, 2011

• Canadian Bioethics Society, St. John, New Brunswick; June 2-4, 2011
  – **Bean S.** Tele-trust: Examining Telemedicine’s Impact on the Fiduciary Relationship
  – Bruni, R. Anstey, K. **Bean S.** Heesters, A. Zlotnik-Shaul, R. A Survey of Clinical Ethics Consultation Practices and Procedures
  – Winsor, S. Secker, B. Macri, R. McDonald, M. Bruni, R. **Bean S.** What Counts as Best Practice in Documenting Ethics Consultation

• American Society for Bioethics in the Humanities, Minneapolis, MN; Oct. 13-16, 2011
  **Bean S.** Enhancing Research Ethics Decision-making: A Research Ethics Decision Bank to Promote Decision-Making

• **Bean S.** Is There a Right to Healthcare? Joint Centre for Bioethics, MHSc Bioethics Foundations course; University of Toronto, ON, Oct. 21, 2011

• Accreditation Canada Ethics in Healthcare, Toronto, ON; Nov. 3-4, 2011
  **Bean, S. Henry, B.** Szego, M. (Poster Presentation) Robust Ethics Consult Information Management: a vital consult service component toward impacting quality patient care


• **Bean S.** Who Gets Access to Care? Ethical Obligations & the Uninsured Patient. MHSc Law & Bioethics; University of Toronto, Joint Centre for Bioethics, Dec. 1, 2011

• Russell B. Godkin D. Callaghan R. **Bean S.** Invited to Serve on an Animal Care Committee: Will you or won't you? University of Toronto, Joint Centre for Bioethics. CORE Network Presentation. Dec. 14, 2011.
2010 External Conference Presentations & Invited Lectures


- **Henry B.** November 18, 2010. “Death, Dying and Dementia: A philosophical, anthropological and ethical review of issues” Alzheimer’s Association of Canada- Lunch and Learn session for staff. (20 participants)


- **Henry B.** Feb 25, 2010. “Ethical Issues in End of Life Research” SoCRA Meeting, Toronto Chapter (attendance 45)

- **Canadian Association of Research Ethics Boards (CAREB), Ontario Conference; Toronto, ON; Nov. 19, 2010**
  - Bean S. Research Ethics Board Management of Researcher Conflicts of Interest.

- **Bean S.** Advanced Directives. University of Toronto, Philosophy 440 Guest Lecture. Nov. 10, 2010

- **Bean S.** Community-Based Research: Proximity and the role of the Peer Recruiter. University of Toronto HIV Research Ethics Board, July 5, 2010.

- **American Society for Bioethics in the Humanities, San Diego, CA; Oct. 21-24, 2010**
  - Bean S. Expanding the Hybrid Continuum: Development & Implementation of the Hybrid Ethics Taxonomy

- **Sunnybrook Health Science Services Inter-professional Education/Inter-professional Collaboration Showcase, Toronto, ON, June 16, 2010.**
  - Winsor, S. Bean, S. Henry, B. Marshall, A. Wheel in Motion: Evolving the Hub & Spoke Model to Strengthen Program-Based Ethics Capacity

- **International Conference on Clinical Ethics Consultation, Portland, Oregon; May 2010**
  - Bean S. Navigating the Murky Intersection between Clinical & Organizational Ethics: A Hybrid Case Taxonomy

- **National Council on Ethics in Human Research, Ottawa, Ontario Feb. 20, 2010**


2010 & 2011 Academic Citizenship Activities

- **FACULTY APPOINTMENT**
  - Henry, B, Lecturer, DFCM

- **EDITORIAL BOARD MEMBER**
  - Bean S. *Journal of Clinical Research & Bioethics*, June 2010 to present

- **NOT-FOR-PROFIT BOARD MEMBER**
  - Bean S. Healthcare Interpretation Network, June 2010 to September 2010 (appointed interim member)
  - Bean S. Healthcare Interpretation Network, September 2010-September 2012 (elected member)

- **ACADEMIC ADVISORY POSITION**
  - Henry, B University of Toronto, Palliative Care Residency Program (Member)

- **PEER REVIEWER**
  - Bean S. *Risk Management and Healthcare Policy* (December 2011 to present)
  - Bean S. *Medicolegal and Bioethics* (December 2011 to present)
  - Bean S. *Philosophy, Ethics, and Humanities in Medicine* (February 2011 to present)
  - Bean S. *The American Journal of Bioethics* (January 2011 to present)
  - Bean S. *IRB: Ethics in Human Subject Research* (August 2010 to present)
  - Bean S. *Canadian Medical Association Journal* (2009 to present)
  - Bean S. *Journal of Medical Ethics* (2008 to present)

- **SUPERVISOR**
  - MHSc Practicum Supervisor at the University of Toronto, Joint Centre for Bioethics:
    - Bean S. Jaime Guerrero, MHSc student, Fall 2011-Spring 2012
  - Supervisor for Joint Centre for Bioethics Clinical & Organizational Ethics Fellows
    - Bean S. & Henry B. Michael Szego, PhD, MHSc, summer 2011 during Sunnybrook rotation
EC Consultation Summary

*In 2011, partnership with Clinical Studies Resource Centre ended which is reason for decrease in research consults

251 Consults 2010
187 Consults 2011

Hybrid represents a combination of clinical/organizational and research consults
Top 5 Ethical Issues arising in Ethics Consultations

• 2010 Top 5 Issues
  1) Tx plan development
  2) Withholding/ withdrawing care
  3) Resource allocation
  4) Discharge Planning
  5) Capacity

• 2011 Top 5 Issues
  1) Tx plan development
  2) Discharge planning
  3) Resource allocation
  4) Capacity
  5) Uninsured patients
Internal Educational Events & Debriefing Sessions

- Aim of debriefing sessions is to assist staff in dealing with moral distress following a challenging case/situation

### Year vs. # of Sessions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th># of Sessions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## External Ethics Educational Events

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Total number of sessions</th>
<th>External sessions</th>
<th>Total number of participants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>3344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>2629</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Future Directions:

• Continued emphasis on organizational ethics

• Commitment to ongoing capacity building

• Expand EC’s profile & visibility

• Ethics Centre Revenue Generation
Sally Bean, Ethicist & Policy Advisor  1.0 FTE
Blair Henry, Ethicist  0.8 FTE

On-line Consult, Debrief or Educational Requests (available internally only):
http://ec/
Intranet Page:
The Grey Zone Blog: (please follow it!)
http://yoursay.sunnybrook.ca/

Contact Us:  sally.bean@sunnybrook.ca  416-480-6100 x5081
blair.henry@sunnybrook.ca  416-480-6100 x7178